January 4, 2023

MEMORANDUM

TO: Power Committee

FROM: John Fazio, Senior Power Systems Analyst

SUBJECT: 2027 Resource Adequacy Assessment

BACKGROUND:

Presenters: John Ollis, John Fazio, Dan Hua, Dor Hirsh Bar Gai

Summary: Staff will brief the Power Committee on the results of the resource adequacy assessment for 2027. Analysis indicates that the regional power supply will not be adequate when relying solely on existing resources, existing reserve levels, and on no new energy efficiency measures. However, adequacy is expected to be maintained if resources and reserves identified in the 2021 Power Plan’s resource strategy are added to the supply. If future electricity market supplies are significantly limited or if demand increases rapidly (e.g., with the implementation of accelerated electrification policies) or if major resources are retired earlier than expected without replacement, then additional resources and reserves will be required to maintain adequacy, as anticipated by the 2021 Power Plan.

After review and discussion, staff will ask the committee to recommend that the Council agree to release the 2027 Resource Adequacy Assessment publicly, including any committee amendments to the executive summary and after any needed editorial edits to the report. In addition, staff will ask the committee to recommend that the Council direct staff to continue the development of the multi-metric approach for future assessments, as we believe it provides a more robust approach for assessing adequacy.
The committee’s recommendation will go before the full Council later at this January meeting. Note that staff will be seeking the informal endorsement of the Council members for the public release of the adequacy assessment, not a formal decision of the Council by motion and vote.

Relevance: Resource adequacy is a critical component of the Council’s mandate to develop a regional power plan that “ensures an adequate, efficient, economic and reliable power supply.” To test the efficacy of the plan’s resource strategy, the Council – in cooperation with regional stakeholders – annually assesses the adequacy of the power supply with planned resource additions derived from the plan’s resource strategy. The annual assessment is based on a resource adequacy standard established by the Council in 2011. However, for this year’s assessment, the Council enhanced its assessment by also examining measures related to shortfall frequency, duration, and magnitude.

Background: An adequate power supply should meet the electric energy requirements of its customers within acceptable limits, considering a reasonable range of uncertainty in resource availability and in demand. Resource uncertainty includes forced outages, early retirements and variations in wind, solar and market supplies. Demand uncertainty includes variations due to temperature, economic conditions, and other factors. Resource availability and demand are also affected by environmental policies, such as those aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

The Council uses a Monte-Carlo simulation model to assess the likelihood of a future year having one or more disruptions to service, when considering the many different combinations of future resource availabilities and demands described above. The metric used, referred to as the annual loss of load probability (LOLP), has been instrumental in the development of the Council’s power plans since the early 2000s. However, due to increasing complexities (e.g., significant development of renewable and distributed resources, adoption of clean-air laws and a more dynamic market environment), LOLP is no longer sufficient to accurately measure the adequacy of the region’s power supply and the risk to customers.

An enhanced adequacy assessment includes metrics related to the frequency, duration, and magnitude of potential shortfalls. The objectives for the new standard are to:

- Prevent high use of emergency measures
- Limit occurrences of very long shortfall events
- Limit occurrences of big capacity shortfalls
- Limit occurrences of big energy shortfalls
With the approval of the Council, staff will continue to develop this approach to assess adequacy and will work with all stakeholders to refine the limits set for all adequacy measures.
2027 Adequacy Assessment

January 10, 2023
Power Committee
Overview

- Role of the Adequacy Assessment
- Adequacy Metrics
- Results Overview
- Next Steps
Role of Assessment

- Assess bulk power system adequacy of the plan’s resource strategy.
- A resource adequacy assessment is only a relative measure of customer risk.
- The assessment focuses on bulk system supply-side adequacy, not distribution.
- By examining additional adequacy measures, the Council can identify the risks associated with shortfalls in regional power supply more precisely.
Reminder of Proposed Metrics

- **LOLEV** – Prevent overly frequent use of emergency measures
  - Expected number of shortfall events/year, counting all shortfall events
  - Adequacy Limit = TBD, possible range 0.1 or 0.2 shortfall events/year

- **Duration VaR\(_{97.5}\)** – Limit the risk of long shortfall events to 1/40 years
  - Longest shortfall event for the 97.5\(^{th}\) worst simulation year
  - Adequacy Limit = TBD, possible range 8 to 12 hours (e.g., start of a cold snap or heat wave)

- **Peak VaR\(_{97.5}\)** – Limit the risk of big capacity shortfalls to 1/40 years
  - Highest single-hour shortfall for the 97.5\(^{th}\) worst simulation year
  - Adequacy Limit = TBD, possible range 2,000 to 3,000 MW
  - Limit set to aggregate emergency capacity or acceptable amount of single-hour demand at risk

- **Energy VaR\(_{97.5}\)** – Limit the risk of big energy shortfalls to 1/40 years
  - Total annual shortfall energy for the 97.5\(^{th}\) worst simulation year
  - Adequacy Limit = TBD, possible range 4,000 to 8,000 MWh
  - Limit set to aggregate emergency energy or acceptable amount of annual energy demand at risk
Reminder of Reference Scenario

- **Resource Strategy (RS Ref)**
  1. 1,000 aMW of new EE
  2. 720 MW of new DR
  3. 5,410 MW of additional new Renewables
     - 590 MW of new renewables already built since plan
  4. 6,000 MW of Up Reserves
     - 3,100 MW of additional balancing up reserves over current regional reserve assumptions

- **Resource Strategy (Min RS)**
  1. 750 aMW of new EE
  2. 720 MW of new DR
  3. 2,910 MW of additional new Renewables
     - 590 MW of new renewables already built since plan
  4. 6,000 MW of Up Reserves
     - 3,100 MW of additional balancing up reserves over current regional reserve assumptions

- **No Resource Strategy (No RS)**
  - Just the 590 MW of new renewables already built since plan

---

2021 Plan Strategy

- **Energy Efficiency**: 750-1,000 aMW
- **Renewable Resources**: at least 3,500 MW (wind, solar, etc.)
- **Demand Response**: 720 MW
  - 520 MW of demand voltage regulation
  - 200 MW from time-of-use rates
- **Additional reserves for adequacy**: at least 3,100 MW
Reminder of Studies

- Resource Strategy baseline (*RS Ref*)
- No Resource Strategy (*No RS*)
- Minimum Resource Strategy (*Min RS*)
- Limited Markets (*RS Ref*)
- High WECC Demand (*RS Ref, +200 aMW EE*)
- Global Instability (*RS Ref*)
- Early Coal Retirement (*RS Ref*)
- No WECC Buildout (*RS Ref*)
- SW Drought (*RS Ref*)
- Pipeline Freeze (*RS Ref*)
- Wildfire (*RS Ref*)
Key Takeaways

- System is adequate with the plan resource strategy but is not adequate if we do nothing.
  - In the high demand world, we need to do more, as described in the strategy
  - When retiring existing resources early, we need to do more, as indicated in plan analysis

- Strategy effective at eliminating summer shortfalls and mitigating winter events

- Market reliance limit is serving us well for now, but market dynamics do pose some risks to monitor
System is Adequate in 2027 Under Plan Strategy

- System is adequate with the plan resource strategy.

- The system is not adequate if we do nothing.

- High WECC demand (caused by, say, a faster pace of electrification) is a risk requiring more resources as outlined in the plan strategy.

- Plan analysis showed and this study confirmed that early coal retirement is a risk requiring more resources to maintain adequacy.
### Results Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Provisional Limit</th>
<th>&lt;5%</th>
<th>0.1-0.2 Event-year 8-12 Hours</th>
<th>2,000-3,000 MW</th>
<th>4,000-8,000 MWh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Study</strong></td>
<td>LOLP</td>
<td>LOLEV</td>
<td>VaR Duration</td>
<td>VaR Peak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS Ref</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.067</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No RS</td>
<td>46.1</td>
<td>0.933</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Min RS</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.061</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited Markets</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High WECC Demand</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>0.589</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Instability</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Coal</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>0.233</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No WECC Buildout</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>0.172</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW Drought</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.083</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pipeline Freeze</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wildfire</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.067</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **RS Ref**: 4.4 0.067 2 357 590
- **No RS**: 46.1 0.933 6 2922 12504
- **Min RS**: 4.4 0.061 2 837 1666
- **Limited Markets**: 7.8 0.144 2 1450 3147
- **High WECC Demand**: 17.2 0.589 5 4792 36617
- **Global Instability**: 7.2 0.144 3.5 2041 5969
- **Early Coal**: 13.9 0.233 2.5 1895 3807
- **No WECC Buildout**: 8.3 0.172 3.5 2015 6410
- **SW Drought**: 5 0.083 2 744 1421
- **Pipeline Freeze**: 5 0.072 1.5 505 710
- **Wildfire**: 4.4 0.067 2 357 590

Adequate with resources tested
Not adequate with resources tested
Borderline with resources tested
Executive Summary

- Did we capture these points to your satisfaction?
Strategy Most Effective at Addressing Certain Types of Shortfalls

The strategy...

- Eliminates summer shortfalls
- Mitigates winter shortfalls
- Limits remaining shortfalls to ramp hours
- Protects against long duration shortfalls
## Heatmap of Maximum Capacity Shortfall by Month-Hour

### Reference with Resource Strategy (RS Ref)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month / Hour</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
<th>19</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>21</th>
<th>22</th>
<th>23</th>
<th>24</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1300</td>
<td>3203</td>
<td>2856</td>
<td>1915</td>
<td>792</td>
<td>402</td>
<td>443</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Reference Without Resource Strategy (No RS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month / Hour</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
<th>19</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>21</th>
<th>22</th>
<th>23</th>
<th>24</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3149</td>
<td>5222</td>
<td>4964</td>
<td>4398</td>
<td>3699</td>
<td>496</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>334</td>
<td>2560</td>
<td>3010</td>
<td>3357</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1844</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>782</td>
<td>780</td>
<td>94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>746</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>467</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1323</td>
<td>4275</td>
<td>4496</td>
<td>1732</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Protection Against Long Duration Shortfalls

- Wildfire: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 2
- Pipeline Freeze: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 1
- SW Drought: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 2
- No WECC Buildout: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 3
- Early Coal: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 2
- Global Instability: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 3
- High WECC Demand: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 5
- Limited Markets: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 2
- Min RS: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 2
- No RS: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 5
- RS Ref: VaR$_{97.5}$ Duration 2

Max Shortfall Duration:
- Wildfire: 5
- Pipeline Freeze: 5
- SW Drought: 5
- No WECC Buildout: 5
- Early Coal: 5
- Global Instability: 5
- High WECC Demand: 11
- Limited Markets: 5
- Min RS: 5
- No RS: 7
- RS Ref: 5

Hours: 8 to 12 Hours Provisional Range

Northwest Power and Conservation Council
Executive Summary

- Did we capture these points to your satisfaction?
Current Market Reliance Limit Offers Effective Risk Mitigation

- Out-of-region market supply uncertainties have a minimal effect on regional adequacy, assuming the Council’s current market reliance limits:
  - Drought
  - Gas supply issues
  - Wildfire

- However, under certain future scenarios results show regional adequacy levels to become borderline or unacceptable:
  - High gas prices coupled with continued supply chain challenges
  - Lower than expected west-wide renewable generation acquisition
  - Increased WECC demand
## Results Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Provisional Limit</th>
<th>&lt;5%</th>
<th>0.1-0.2 Event-year</th>
<th>8-12 Hours</th>
<th>2,000-3,000 MW</th>
<th>4,000-8,000 MWh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>LOLP</td>
<td>LOLEV</td>
<td>VaR Duration</td>
<td>VaR Peak</td>
<td>Var Energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS Ref</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.067</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No RS</td>
<td>46.1</td>
<td>0.933</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2922</td>
<td>12504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Min RS</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.061</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>837</td>
<td>1666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited Markets</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1450</td>
<td>3147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High WECC Demand</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>0.589</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4792</td>
<td>36617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Instability</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2041</td>
<td>5969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Coal</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>0.233</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1895</td>
<td>3807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No WECC Buildout</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>0.172</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>6410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW Drought</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.083</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>744</td>
<td>1421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pipeline Freeze</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>505</td>
<td>710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wildfire</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.067</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>590</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Adequate with resources tested
- Not adequate with resources tested
- Borderline with resources tested

**Northwest Power and Conservation Council**
Future WECC Buildouts May Pose Market Dynamic Risks

- Projected renewable resource acquisition driven by clean policies is expected to change market supply and demand dynamics
  - Hourly pattern of renewable generation does not always coincide with the hourly pattern of greatest energy need.
  - Certain periods of the day may have very inexpensive market supply due to renewable surplus (mostly solar).

- Under conditions of increased supply and lower prices, the Northwest is expected to consistently import more power than it has in the past.

- However, there also will be times within the same day, often during morning and evening ramps, when available market supply is less and more expensive.
  - This provides an opportunity for the Northwest to export to other regions in the west but also means that those are the times of most market risk for the Northwest.

- The ability of the Northwest hydroelectric and thermal systems to ramp up and down to respond to those changing market dynamics requires appropriate market signals, either from a regional reserve pooling effort or from an enhanced market structure.
CA Import/Export During Summer and Winter Ramp Hours

Northwest Power and Conservation Council
Comparison of California Prices

Reduced buildouts $\rightarrow$ higher prices and narrower distribution in CA

Higher summer prices

Very small/no buildouts nearly eliminate negative prices

Study: RS Ref, Global Instability, High WECC Demand, Limited Markets, No WECC Buildout
Executive Summary

- Did we capture these points to your satisfaction?
Are These the Right Key Takeaways?

- We discussed:
  - Scenarios and conditions of system adequacy
  - Effectivity to eliminate summer and mitigate winter shortfalls
  - Impact of future market dynamics

- Are there additional points for your considerations?
Next Steps

- Make any modifications to proposed executive summary and assessment report
- Council discussion on releasing 2023 Adequacy Assessment report
- Continue to monitor risks identified in the assessment
Appendix
Limited Markets

- Removed planning reserve margins
  - Implemented by setting operating pool planning reserve margins to -99 in AURORA
  - All other inputs the same as the baseline
High WECC Demand

- High electrification in Pacific NW, California, BC and Alberta
  - High demand only in those areas, baseline forecast elsewhere
- All other inputs the same as the baseline, except updating policy targets (in MWhs)
Persistent Global Instability

- Higher fuel costs and delayed renewable deployment.
  - Implemented by changing maximum annual new additions on short duration storage, solar and wind generation until 2030.
- Other resource ramps unchanged due to online date or previous restrictions
- All other inputs the same as the baseline
Early Coal Retirement

- Removal of Colstrip 3 and 4 from the adequacy analysis without replacement
No WECC Buildout

- Only existing resources across the WECC, except the NW
- Reference resource strategy included for the PNW
Pipeline Freeze-off

i. Loss of 5,000 MW natural gas from Arizona

ii. November – February
SW Drought

i. Glen Canyon – 1,312 MW
   i. Removal of 923 MW (Arizona)

ii. Hoover – 2,078 MW
   i. Removal of 730 MW (Arizona)
   ii. Removal of 316 MW (Nevada South)

iii. Lake Oroville – 645 MW
   i. Removal of 542 MW (No_Cal)

iv. Lake Shasta – 714 MW
   i. Removal of 315 MW (No_Cal)

Removal of 2,826 MW SW hydro
Wildfire

1. BPA_OR <-> PACW: 5,800 MW
   i. 11_71

2. BPA_OR <-> IP: 2,000 MW
   i. 11_161

3. BPA_OR <-> BPA_WA: 7,500 MW
   i. 11_21

4. Wildfire dates:
   i. July 16-23

   ii. Derating:
       i. 50-90% of lines
Comparison of Reference to Minimum?

- Recap on difference:
  - Renewables:
    - Additional 2,500 MW
  - Energy Efficiency
    - Additional 250 MW

- Main Impact:
  - Reduction of shortfall magnitudes
    - Decreased reliance on emergency resources

![Graph showing comparison of EUE (MWh)](image)

- Frequency • Similar
- Duration • Similar
- Peak • Reduction of 480 MW
- Energy • Reduction of 1,076 MWh
Example of Daily California Summer Import/Export Behavior

This example highlights the impact of High WECC Demand on a summer day (Aug):
1. Substantially less import during the morning ramp (A)
2. Earlier start to exporting during mid-day (B)
3. Less export in the evening ramp and night (C)
4. Less mid-day import (D)

Positive = PNW import from California | Negative = PNW export to California
Average* California Import/Export

- Substantial reduction in average imports (MWh) under High WECC Demand, Limited Markets and No WECC Buildout
  - Persistent Global Instability shows a smaller impact on imports
- For exports, reduction across scenarios is observed, especially High WECC Demand
  - Persistent Global Instability is the only scenario suggesting higher exports during the summer months

*Average across all import/export hours respectively in each month
Note on Canadian imports: Alberta relies on imports from BC and region for adequacy and economics in the recent past, but this has already changed to primarily economic exchanges.

For context as of December 8th, 2022 at 10 am, the market had 11.8 GW generating with 3 GW of unused gas plants.

The Alberta_XX represents the supply capability near the price, XX $/MWh.